

KAI TAK FANTASY

SECOND STAGE ADJUDICATION

JURY REPORT

General

During the second stage adjudication process, the Jury Panel has placed emphasis on the following criteria in selecting the winner:

- branding and image
- innovation and creativity
- originality and identity in place making
- harmonize and synergise with the neighbourhood
- sustainability and green design
- feasibility in implementation
- cost effectiveness, and
- response to design requirements.

The Jury Panel has also taken into account views of the public via the report of Public Engagement process prepared by Social Services Research Centre, HKU.

While recognizing that each of the four shortlisted entries has its own merit, the Jury Panel is looking for, in particular, a winning scheme with a big, fresh visionary idea serving the future need of Hong Kong, and is implementable at the same time.

During the adjudication process, the Jury Panel agreed that Kai Tak is probably the last piece of land on water. Hong Kong is already a built up area and people would need more green public space rather than more large buildings and hard surfaces. A more relaxing atmosphere with greenery and cycling tracks would be more preferable to more commercial uses. It is agreed by all Jury Panel members that maximum development return shall not be an over-whelming consideration, but rather, to create a destination that can create synergy with the initiative of Energizing Kowloon East, being attractive, green and low carbon.

Entry A

The Jury Panel appreciates that this Entry possesses a lot of talking points and is liked by young people in terms of its identity and creativity. The Jury Panel is also impressed by the innovative use of modular floating elements, extending the urban fabric into the waterway, to create flexible, dynamic and versatile place filled with local culture and heritage. There are also attractive features such as the beach and small floating elements.

The Jury Panel, however, notices that the scheme places too much emphasis on the water body such that the other part of the Kai Tak Fantasy and the land-water interface are almost unattended. The feasibility of implementation of this scheme, without compromising the key concept, is low in view of the PHO implication and the water quality.

Entry B

The Jury Panel acknowledges this Entry as a pragmatic design solution with a unique low-rise terraced megastructure in the absence of any tall tower, to create various spaces on land, and a network of openable swing bridges in the water body. The Jury Panel finds that the stepped terrace and the landside facilities are able to create a destination for people to enjoy. But largely it creates enclosed ambience within the building structures. Activities in the water body are contrastingly passive in nature.

What is lacking in this Entry is the innovativeness and uniqueness in characters. It can be anywhere in Hong Kong. The Jury Panel opines that attractiveness and vibrancy of the area should be further enhanced.

Entry C

The Jury Panel is impressed by this innovative and attractive scheme with a green and sustainable concept that send out a clear message to the public. The natural treatment of the water edge is particularly encouraging. The Jury Panel agrees that this is the only entry that has consider keeping the water clean by tidal flushing action, possibly making the apparently otherwise largely dead water body alive and fresh.

The Entry is successful in creating a unique place with a big idea. Among all entries, it fares the best in branding Kai Tak Fantasy, creating an identity in place making and synergising with the neighbourhood.

The scheme has translated the Healthy City concept in full by creating venues, like new channel, curvilinear shoreline seamlessly integrated into the land for uses for health, culture, education and commercial. The Jury Panel opines that while West Kowloon is cultural, the scheme has given Kai Tak a potential to become a water sports centre because of its interesting shoreline. As a result, the West and East Kowloon will become two very unique new life style for people in Hong Kong.

The Jury Panel further opines that, certain improvements still need to be made when this entry is further developed. These shall include developing a controlled water body for water sports, improving the architecture design and creating a bicycle friendly place. Further, there shall be more integration between the building proposed and the green open space created.

Entry D

The Jury Panel is impressed by the simplicity and clarity of the design concept with a "sky-roof" as an essence of the scheme that echoes with the form of the Cruise Terminal. The longitudinal layered alignment of land use and urban spaces provides versatile public spaces for active and indoor activities. It is also encouraging to see that the scheme postulates new green ideas like rainwater harvesting, storm grey water reuse and water treatment.

This entry is rather building oriented, while the Jury Panel is looking for more vibrancy, particularly on the water-land interface. Compared to the winning entry, this scheme is regarded as too commercial and has compromised in originality and identity.

- END OF JURY REPORT –

9 November 2014